

American Indian Oral History Collection
Transcript Record

Tape Number: 852 Side: 1

Dating of Taping: 1/2/1972

Field Worker(s): Margaret Snyaz

Tribe(s): NIA

Location(s): UNM Campus

Narrator/Event: Bob Young^{BIA}, Linguist

Additional Narrator(s): _____

Subject(s): Indian Education Policy 1930s/1940s

Education
Linguistics

Navajo Linguistics

Comments:

AMERICAN INDIAN HISTORICAL RESEARCH PROJECT

University of New Mexico

Tape Number: #852 Side One -

Tribe: ANGLO, former employee of BIA, worked primarily with Navajo, linguist
by training

Informant: Bob Young

Informant's home address: Albuquerque

Band or Clan:

Date and location of interview: 14 January and 1 February 1972
UNM linguistics bldg

Field Worker: Margaret Szasz

Date of transcription: February 25, 1972

Contents: Bi-lingual books written and published around World War II
Willard Beatty and Indian education during his term of office -
1936-1952
Emphasis on Navajo education - 1930's and 1940's
Brief discussion of BIA education program and changes since Beatty's
term of office - Education program under Hildegard Thompson
Some discussion of personalities of the 1930's and 1940's - in BIA
education

Evaluation of Interview:

excellent long range view of bureau programs - Young speaks
well, is more coherent and clear than many.....

Future Prospects:

a very busy man; probably will not want another long discus-
sion

Tape #852 (side 1)
MISCELLANEOUS
Bob Yound (Anglo)
Jan. 14 & Feb. 1, 1972
By M. Szasz

Bi-lingual books
Willard Beaty & Indian educ.
during 1936-1952
Navajo educ. during '30's & '40's
BIA education programs
Hildegard Thompson & Indian educ.

Q. Bob, I mentioned that, what I wanted to go into with you was how you got into working for the Bureau of Indian Affairs and a little bit about your background before you entered in, could you kind of fill me in...?

A. Well, I graduated from the University of Illinois in 1935 and I got my degree in Anthropology and Linguistics and originally I intended to go to Mexico because I was interested in Uto-Aztecan languages and specifically Aztec (?) but circumstances prevented going to Old Mexico and so I decided that I would come first to New Mexico and see how things looked here and see if I was interested... and I did and I came here and enrolled in Graduate School in 1935 at the University of New Mexico and promptly became interested in Athabascan languages instead of Uto-Aztecan languages. So the Albuquerque Indian School made Navajo informants available and so I began work on Navajo and decided that I would use Navajo as a base language for comparative purposes and at that time I was particularly interested in tracing ethnic movements through linguistic relationships. One of those things that people become interested in in that period of their life and I found it very interesting.... In the meantime, or in the course of time between 1935 and 1940, I became acquainted with John P. Harrington, senior ethnologist and linguist at the Smithsonian Institute and he was interested in some of the same subject matter, subject areas that I was; so, I began to work with him, looking towards the possibility of going up to Canada and up to Alaska and doing work up there, based partly on foundation material developed down here.

Q. Tracing your background in other words, for the Athabascan, still with the Athabascan languages?

A. Yes.... in the late 1930's, the Bureau of Indian Affairs became interested in exploring the possibility of using native languages as a medium for communication of ideas

with an adult non-English speaking members of tribes. Several tribes, the Sioux, Navajo, Papago and a variety of others... as far as I was concerned, I was primarily interested in Navajo. They were in contact with Dr. Harrington and oh, through the contact, in the preparation of early bi-lingual material and that sort of thing, I got acquainted with Dr. Beatty and in 1940 Dr. Beatty offered me a position in the Bureau of Indian Affairs... I think I was a specialist in the Navajo language.... that was in 1940 and I was primarily concerned with the development of bi-lingual instructional material for use in the schools. And it was produced largely in Phoenix where they have a print shop in connection with the vocational school. So I would produce material and then go down to Phoenix initially to oversee it's printing, making sure that they spelled words properly and got all the sentences arranged properly and that sort of thing, but I found that it would have taken forever down there to get anything done whatsoever because they just had some Indian students in the print shop and they didn't know how to set type in any language very well and most assuredly they didn't know how to set type in Navajo. So I learned how to run a line-attack machine, quite rapidly and I set the type on the stuff that we produced.

Q. Well, do you have to hand set that?

A. No, by a line-a-type machine, well anyway, it wasn't long after 1940, of course that World War II looming and the situation was beginning to change here, even on the eve of the entry of the United States into the war, and there became, there arose a need... to inform Indian people about what was taking place and to inform them about requirements that might attach to them if they went outside the reservation to work and of course, more and more work opportunities were beginning to develop very rapidly after 1944.... Navajo Indians. So with William Morgan, who was my assistant, we began to develop quite a range of adult materials as well as bi-lingual materials for use by children... in elementary grades. One thing I remember we produced, I don't recall the date now, the publication of the thing... It was called (NAVAJO LANGUAGE) the story of the present war and what it was was a translation of a document... it had a name, but probably something like that, and we secured permission from the publisher to publish it in Navajo and it was published in Navajo and although not very many people could read Navajo, some could and those that could read it to people who couldn't read

and they did get some idea of the antecedents of the conflict and just what was going on. Then to continue to meet adult needs, sometime, it might have been in 1942, '43, I can't recall the dates now, but we began to publish once a month a newspaper in Navajo, we called it (NAVAJO LANGUAGE), of course it gave all types, all sorts of information, not only information relating to the progress of the war, but also information regarding rationing and food stamps and all of the other things, that it was necessary for the people to know generally during the war years and during the same period there was a terrific demand on the part of employers of Navajos, outside the reservation, for some sort of dictionary, something they thought they could use to learn enough Navajo to communicate with workers that they hired, but with whom they couldn't speak, so this led to the development of a sketch of Navajo grammar and a dictionary called the Navajo language.....

- Q. Now excuse me... I want to interrupt you just for a minute... there was no dictionary before this time?
- A. None that was of practical use, no..... there were vocabularies and the ethnological dictionaries that had been produced in previous years at St. Michaels, Arizona, but these dictionaries and vocabularies were of no use to anyone who wanted to learn Navajo for practical purposes. It would be rather complicated for me to explain to you why, but.....
- Q. You could try....
- A. Well, Navajo, the Navajo verb is a very complex element, a linguistic element and the inflection of the verb is very complex and so if you are given one form, unless you know Navajo, you have no way of determining what the rest of the forms are... for the same paradigm.
- Q. There is no root then?
- A. Yes, there is a root, but what you have is a root, and the root carries a verbal meaning in a sort of an abstract form... then that verbal meaning is modified by a number of prefix elements and these prefixed elements are, some of them, are adverbial, some of them indicate mode, some of them indicate tense, aspect of the subject pronoun, the object pronoun, all of these things are bound up in the verbal construction. Well, this would be relatively simple perhaps if it followed regular

rules of construction, but it doesn't.... when these several elements combine they undergo what is called morphophonemic change, they no longer look like they did when they were separate and independent. So there are so many of them and so many potential combinations that unless, as I said, you knew Navajo, if I gave you one form, the probabilities are, you could not understand or determine what the rest of them were so you would be stuck with whatever form I gave you. Well, the dictionaries that were available at the time gave only one form and gave no clues to how to develop the rest of them so they were useless, useless from a practical point of view... so what we did in our dictionary was make the entries in the form of a stem, and verbs, the stems have many suppletive alternates too, it is something like sing, sang, sung... They have different shapes as they relate to different modes and different aspects... but we gave the stems in a consistent order and then we gave the first person of each pertinent mode, sometimes aspectual form, then parenthetically we gave the paratamatic prefixes, which are the ones that apply to the person. So that anyone looking up the word in the dictionary could then look at the parenthetical information and then he could determine how to inflect this particular verb paradigm. And it was more useful of course, in practical things... I'll show you what I mean if you want to turn your little machine off.....

Q. Sure, sure...

A. There are two third person subject pronoun, one of them is Bě and the other one takes the shape Jā within the verb paradigm and the difference, there are many differences, one of the differences between the two is that Jā is somewhat less direct, it's more perhaps comparable to one... in English....

Q. Like the French....

A. Yes, something like that... then, let's see... Jā is a polite form and it used to be required between brother and sister, for example, after they had reached puberty to impose something of a barrier obviously related to the concept of incest, you maintain a distance from certain of your kinfolk. So instead of saying, maybe what do you want... the question would be, what does one want.... this does set up something of a barrier

and then in narrative, Jā is often used for the most important personage or character in the narrative to separate, to distinguish him pronominally from another third person and so in the narrative one can then use the pronoun without the necessity of repeating the noun, because he remembers the character to which Jā initially referred and since you will always be Jā then you know which of two third persons you are speaking about. In English you know that this frequently happens when a person in recounting something will use he and since there are several third persons finally the listener becomes confused and can't remember who he is... he, which he do you mean and in Navajo this is precluded by the use of two third person pronoun. So those are the major aspects of differentiation between two third persons.....

- Q. And since the written language is so recent, they would have used this in their narrative of story telling, is that... I mean verbal story telling?
- A. Oh, yes.
- Q. Very much so....
- A. Cause writing is merely a graphic reflection of what people say and so.....
- Q. I want to ask you a question.... I know that I have cut into your speaking of narratives, your narrative of where you were going, but it was my understanding that the Navajo language was first written in the '30's because of the effort of the government to try to explain the cutback on livestock on the reservation, now what can you tell me about that?
- A. Well, it isn't quite correct to say that the Navajo language was first written in 1930's. I suppose aside from just the few collections of vocabulary that were very poorly written back in the middle of the 19th century, the first serious effort to write down Navajo was by Washington Matthews... He was a post surgeon at Fort Wingate back in the mid-1880's, and aside from being in a position as a surgeon he was very much interested in the linguistics and the ethnology and did alot of very valuable work with Navajo informants of that period and of course that work reflects the really traditional concepts of the whole Navajo society. The missionaries began to move into the reservation serious-

ly at least, and sometimes around the turn of the century... and when they did of course they became concerned as missionaries and as educators, operators of schools, christianization of Indians... So they began to study the Navajo language and they began of course to write and develop various types of translation of religious materials... I assume that the missionaries sometimes don't collaborate very closely with one another, if they belong to different denominations, they of course develop different ways of writing and so one saw the development of a Protestant system... in contrast to a Catholic one, they didn't have anything to do with one another... but the material really is readable, but it has many weaknesses, it has many weaknesses because it wasn't until the 1930's that Father Barra went back to Yale and worked with Edward Super and came to realize that Navajo was a common language before for some reason or another hadn't realized that it was a tone language.

Q. Washington Matthews knew that?

A. No... and neither did the previous religious writing systems and they didn't indicate tone, somehow they misconstrued tone as stress and didn't mark it at all.

Q. Forgive me if I ask you what the difference is...

A. Well... it means that these monosyllabic elements that either enter into this verbal construction that I pointed out to you here in the book, each one carries with them it's tone level, Navajo has two tones, a low and a high, two intermediates of falling and rising, well the differences in meaning then, that would give them construction may hinge on tone, so if I said to you... if I said to you (NAVAJO) that means he is... if I said (NAVAJO) that means you are, so (NAVAJO) makes a difference... (NAVAJO) makes a difference between two words. The first of which means mouth and the second of which means medicine and so the only difference in the, the only thing that distinguishes meaning is the inherent tone. Well, the missionaries in the early systems of writing didn't mark tone, so sometimes it is very difficult to determine just what form of the word fits the context best... and then they didn't always mark vowel lengths and contrasting vowel lengths in Navajo also distinguishes meaning.... If I said (NAVAJO) then I say his soup or his juice... because this is long and this is

the distinction... (NAVAJO) and that sort of thing, but they didn't always mark these and as a result sometimes it is a little difficult to figure out what word was involved. Anyway in the 1930's it became obvious that Navajo was a tone language and St. Michaels began to mark tones in their translation of Navajo words. They used, the St. Michaels after the training that Father Barrard got from Edward Supier, St. Michaels began to use the form of transcription, the letter forms that were, I guess derived from the international phonetic alphabet, and used by Dr. Supier, who was primarily interested in comparative linguistics. So the thesis was that it was better to use just one grapheme, one alphabetic form for one sound and then wherever this sound occurred in other languages, it would be quickly relatable to Navajo in this instance. So they used for example the Greek (GREEK) to represent dl, we write it dl, and they used the Greek (GREEK) with the little, oh yeah, the little inverted circumflex on the top of it to represent clah... which we write as t with an l and with a bar through it and then they used the Greek (GREEK) with an inverted circumflex and an apostrophe within this inverted circumflex represent ah, as in the word clah... and the point is, that when the Bureau of Indian Affairs became interested in the possibility of utilizing written Navajo for communications purposes, this system of writing was much too cumbersome, it couldn't be reproduced on an ordinary typewriter you had to have special characters on a typewriter in order to write it... and the decision then had already been reached by the 1930's to utilize a special form which came to be known as government system of writing, I guess which is the one that you see here and it makes minimal use of unusual characters, there are really none at all except the bar and an l to represent a voiceless l, since there are voiced and voiceless l in Navajo..... nothing....

- Q. I was going to say... then there actually has been quite a bit of background in writing Navajo before the Bureau got involved in it?
- A. Yes, it goes back towards the opening of the century really... well you could probably start it with Washington Matthews... because I think he is the first person that made any serious efforts to transcribe Navajo.
- Q. What did he transcribe, a dictionary?

- A. Oh no, he transcribed ethnological materials... legends, songs, chants... and that sort of thing...if you get his book entitled the Night Chant.... you will find alot of transcriptions of chants and translations and really you have to read the translations to read the transcriptions because you know, he wasn't really... he did not have the kind of training that people had 75 years later, or however long it is... So as a net result, of course he was just doing his best... and write down what he thought he heard.
- Q. Was the Bureau able to... do you know if they were able to communicate with the Navajos by writing some of the instructions, writing for instance... explaining why..?
- A. Reading regulations and that sort of thing.... Back at the beginning when they initially began to use written Navajo there were a wide variety of motivations... one lay in the field of health and they had an interpreter school at Fort Defiance sometime back in the 1930's... 1936, 1937.... something like that, in an effort to develop a vocabulary of terms that could be used by medical interpreters and thus pave the way to better diagnosis of patients..... So, this was one motivation in the area of health. Another was of course, in the area of those on going federal programs that the administration placed big importance on, one of which was as you pointed out, stock reduction. So some materials were in fact developed relating to grazing controls and that sort of thing, in fact we even translated the grazing permits into Navajo and that sort of thing.
- Q. Who was involved in it during this period... this was before you got in....?
- A. No, when I say grazing permits... I am already in the picture by that time... grazing permits... court forms, that is all I can think of... they were translated into Navajo.
- Q. But did you get into this before 1940 when you took on that official commission?
- A. Only to the extent that I was in the field out in the Navajo country and Harrington was in Washington and Harrington was in contact with Beatty and so between the three of us, we were working at a distance, but at that period I wasn't concerned with subject matter re-

lated to livestock control or anything, it was primarily with primers and pre-primers for use in teaching written Navajo to children and to adults.....

Q. This was still in the '30's then that you are talking about, before you took the official commission...?

A. And then even after 1940 there was very little written in Navajo relating to livestock control, it was such a highly controversial deal that I was very reluctant to put anything in written Navajo that related to it because it could kill it and I didn't.....

----- INTERRUPTION

Q. Let's go in just a little more to how much you actually worked with the bi-lingual instructional material before you were actually hired on officially.....

A. Well, working with Dr. Harrington, who in turn was in contact with the education office and the Bureau of Indian Affairs... materials were developed for pre-primers primers, charts, that sort of thing... largely by people who had some expertise in the writing of children's literature, pre-primers. Unfortunately at that period, they had to be written in English first and then translated into Navajo which is not really a very good approach to the preparation of primer material for use in another language. Obviously the logical approach is to do it in the language originally and determine vocabulary in accordance with the type of vocabulary that beginning children speaking that language as their native language have..... Of course that is one of the areas of concern of this Navajo reading study that I am now involved with. We are producing material primer material and that sort of thing in Navajo, but it is being done by Navajos who at the same time are in the College of Education. Some of them have already had experience as elementary teachers so they are well equipped as native speakers with this kind of educational and training background to produce children's literature that is far superior to anything that we were able to produce... in the 1930's. At that time there weren't any Navajos trained as teachers who could fill this need, so the other approach was taken by Dr. Beatty, and you have Little Man's Family for example. Well, Little Man's Family I suppose is quite adequate in its English version because it was written by someone who

was trained in the production of children's literature in English, but that doesn't mean that when these same terms were translated into Navajo that they were necessarily also within the range of simple children's language....

Q. You mean, even so, the pre-primer and the primer was written or was attempted to be written in the cultural terminology of the people. It still would be inadequate because it was not translatable?

A. Well, it was translatable but when the translation was completed, it wasn't the kind of text that you would have developed had you begun the project from the point of view of Navajo exclusively....

Q. Somewhere I have run across this criticism.

A. Yeah.

Q. I don't recall where but...

A. It may have come ultimately from me, cause I am one of the major critics and I am trying to prevent the continued use of this same material now... I consider the material that the girls are producing out here to be far superior and I would like to see it used now, since it is possible to produce this kind of material, but now and then for that matter, I could make no claims to be an expert in the preparation of children's literature... so.....

Q. It is a little out of your field.

A. Yes, it is just a little out of my field.

Q. Were you doing the translating though?

A. Yes, I was doing it, often with William Morgan, and other Navajo assistants who were available at the time.

Q. Was this true of all of the books, the primer, and the pre-primer books that were being written at that time? Were they first written in English and then translated?

A. At... in this initial period, yes.....

Q. Of the late 30's and 40's?

A. Yes... and then in the early 40's we took a slightly different attack, we took Navajo stories, Coyote Stories and things of that nature.... and we simplified them by in, well instead of telling them the way an adult would tell them, we told them in terms of just little short sentences.... I don't think very attractively, but nonetheless it was an effort to overcome this business of translation and it was paraphrasing. You can just take a text of a story and you can just extract from it the salient features and ideas and then express them in short lines.... So coyote said let it rain and that sort of thing... went down the line and you had the skeleton then of the story.....

Q. Well how would you evaluate this program of Beatty's?

A. The bi-lingual program?

Q. Right.

A. Well.... I felt that there was a great deal of merit and I still do... to the use of native languages to communicate with adult people for that matter who can't speak any other language it is the only one they know and the only medium through which they can get a clear concept of whatever is involved. Secondly I do feel that it... I do feel that it is logical, a child entering school and learning the mechanics of reading and writing which is quite a mechanical skill in itself... but it can do so more easily if he understands and knows the language that he is writing, than he can if he is learning the skills of reading and writing in one he can't understand. I can't quite conceive of my own child reading and writing more rapidly if I put my child in a grade school where he learned to read and write in Greek, without knowing Greek and so, yes, I feel that there is merit to it, and I think that Beatty's approach was very sound. There were many, many constraints at the period however.... the obvious being that there were very few if any Navajo teachers in the late 1930's and early 40's, there might have been one here and there.. but there were very, very few. Many of them had gone through school in preceding period when the use of the native language was absolutely forbidden and so they didn't have a very good command of it.... and in the absence of native speakers in the school themselves. It became very difficult to teach written Navajo to children with no one to teach. I used to go around

the reservation and hold classes and during this period, the early 40's, but I would be the only one that would be available to teach even children how to read and write in their own language. So this kind of constraint of course would really, really impose a terrific obstacle to the idea of bi-lingual education. In other words, Beatty's project was perhaps just a little bit before its time... in the late 30's and early 40's... Now perhaps the need is declining, but the situation, the climate has improved drastically.... if we had had in the early 1940's the proportion of Navajo teachers in working in the schools that we have presently it could have really gone forward rapidly. And we had Navajo assistants... I had Navajo assistants who carried on adult classes in various parts of the reservation, teaching people how to read, to read the newspaper so they could be kept abreast of things that were taking place. Well there are many other factors too back in the 1930's and 1940's that enter the picture as a constraint, primarily going back to the educational policy of the pre-Collier period were de-indianization and de-culturation of Indians was the primary objection of educators, christianization was one of the principal objectives and not necessarily through the use of the native language, they would use it where it was absolutely essential and accounts for for the attempts to translate the Bible and that sort of think. Certainly the policies of educators in the period before Collier... were not directed at the use, the continued use of native languages. So after Collier came in, of course, there were many conflicts, between him and Beatty and the new order and the Bureau of Indian Affairs and the new set policy and the people that had been closely identified with the preceding policies so they took the position, why would you want to teach the children Navajo or why do you want to read and write Navajo, learn to read and write in English. The obvious was that adults couldn't possibly learn to read and write in English, it is too complex, to teach them just on basis of sporadic classes now and then.....

Q. Did you encounter some of this complex?

A. Oh yes....

Q. Did you.... now I have never heard anyone talk about this before....

A. It is quite an interesting thing... of course, it is

just a difference of opinion, a difference in basic approach to the idea of dealing with minority people, such as the Navajo....

- Q. Was... what, until they began of course, hiring new teachers as they started doing right away... Would you say that overwhelmingly the people who had long experience in teaching were opposed to Collier's new policies?
- A. I think there were lots of them that were, yes... and you recall at that period, there weren't enough schools really to accomodate all of the Navajo children, and the day schools didn't go very far in terms of grade level. So the missionary schools on the reservation still were in the dominate role... especially related to more advanced education, that is high school level education and missionaries, they had lots of followers and they had them not only among teachers in Bureau schools they had them of course among traders, among elements of the public, around the reservation who agreed that all Indians should become Christians, and should discontinue, their own customs and language.... They had these two camps, and they were pretty sharply delinieated as I saw them...
- Q. Do you feel that... I have encountered this, I believe, do you feel that the missionaries were influential in opposing Collier's policies outside of education, such as the grazing...?
- A. I think the missionaries had a following and they were quite vocal and so also did the trader, who was in contact with the Navajo and did have a medium for communication with them and the trader of course felt that his own economy was jeopardized by such things as livestock reduction, because basically the Navajos were pastoral people at the time and the traders relationship was largely in the form of wool and lambs in exchange for commodities. And the trader felt himself in danger economically and so the traders became by and large enemies of the Collier administration and of Collier. And of course I don't feel that Collier and the people that he had on his staff who were concerned about the economy of reservations, the resources of reservations, were very well advised in moving as rapidly as they did in the direction of livestock reduction. In other words, I think that was really idiotic. It should... it was necessary, people had known that it was necessary since

the 1890's, and if you go through the reports of the Superintendents in those old letter books up there at Window Rock, you will find recurrent references to the decline in physical resources on the reservation and to the worsening condition of livestock. It was really obvious that something had to be done, but nobody knew what to do... Finally you find... what was the assistant Commissioner Merritt, meeting with the Navajos in 1928 and talking about livestock reduction, the need to control numbers but yet now concept of what he is even talking about... And then a few years later of course Collier comes into the picture and you get a national policy implemented through the Department of the Interior aimed at the Soil Conservation and there was a lot of money available during the depression years and with this whole combination factors, made it possible to move in on the Navajo situation very rapidly and since Collier didn't know how long he was going to be in office and felt very strongly that this had to be done, there had to be a diversification of Navajo economy immediately to save what was left. He sanctioned a program that he attempted to implement in entirely too short a period of time. Had it been a long range program designed to be carried out concurrently with education, concurrently with other types of diversification of the reservation economy over a period of let's say two decades... It would have made sense and I think it would have taken place and taken place quite successfully.

Q. But what about the war?

A. Well, of course that injected something else in the economic picture on the reservation because a lot of people went outside the reservation.

Q. Naturally, didn't it do a little bit of what he wanted unintentionally?

A. To an extent it did... it did result in reduction of livestock, but unfortunately when the war ended and people came back, they immediately began to build up their livestock numbers because there was nothing else to do, so it went back to where it was previously....

Q. Did you know Collier?

A. Yes.

Q. You did?

A. Oh yeah.

Q. I have become very interested in the man, of course, it goes over such a long period of time and I have found myself characterizing him just from what I have read... I haven't talked to anyone really.... Would you say that he was the kind of individual who encouraged polarized responses? In other words, you either thought he was tremendous or were very antagonistic towards him?

A. I am sure in his time that was certainly true, because in, for throughout the 19th century really public attitudes towards Indians and federal policies governing Indian programs, including education, had been quite different from the one that Collier introduced and the idea of that, anybody could place any value on Indian traditional cultures... and languages was really unthinkable, it was stupid from the point of view of the opponent. And Collier of course then spoiled the whole set of attitudes and viewpoints that were revolutionary and so being the center of revolution, Collier had a lot of enemies and people either agreed with him, yes there is something of value, it is doubtful that we have good reason to attack it and attempt to tear it apart and annihilate it... and there were, of course, people on the other side who followed the previous line, and said, oh no, for the future benefit of the nation and the Indian, the Indian culture and language must go... at these two conflicting points of view... and Collier was very complex in personality I am sure.... I think he was very sincere, and so far as I am concerned, I think the revolutionary course in federal Indian policy and the Bureau of Indian Affairs after the admit of Collier was far more sound and far more rational than anything that had preceded it, he brought together quite a wide variety of personalities, many of them highly competent people, at least I so considered, Willard Beatty was one. He also brought together some (?) in any organization you have both kinds, it is impossible to always make sure that you always have.....

Q. This is Homer Howard?

A. Yeah, he was quite competent... I don't recall what Homer Howard now was concerned with except that he used to be concerned with the administration or operation of teacher training school that were held every summer.

Q. Right, that is where I have run into him.....

- A. He did other things, but I can't recall what they were.
- Q. What about Samuel Thompson... do you know about him?
- A. Daniel?
- Q. Samuel Thompson...
- A. Samuel Thompson? No.....
- Q. He wrote very long letters alot of which I xeroxed and he was pretty much in charge of public school.
- A. No... in Washington, I presume?
- Q. Well, he traveled alot, all over the country he would write back and.....
- A. Well, if I ever knew him... the name didn't even ring a bell.....
- Q. Yeah, pretty much on the whole you would say the people Collier gathered were sharp?
- A. Yeah, they were sharp people, many of them with anthropological training instead of religious training, which made them quite different... anthropology was almost an athema among many segments, population on or around the reservation. They somehow represented the antithesis of missionaries....
- Q. Who was this man in charge of the anthropology program at that time... McKeel..... Did you know him?
- A. McKeel, I met him, yes... but I don't remember much about him... I remember John Province better because I probably knew him for a longer period of time and knew him a little better.... I didn't have too much contact during that period with people from the Washington level, aside from Willard Beatty and on occasion John Collier, and oh gosh, a man by the name of Daniels, from the education office in Washington. Otherwise I didn't have very much occasion to have any close contact with them, I was too small a cog in the operation to be concerned with that sort of thing.
- Q. Well, do you think that Beatty was wise in launching into the bi-lingual program, given all the problems that you described?

- A. I think in theory he was but in practice, as I said, I think it was before its time, because we didn't have the trained people who could function as teachers.. in a bi-lingual situation and make it work and how do you make it work when you have no teachers and it was totally unfeasible to attempt to make native speakers out of Anglo teachers, make it possible for them to use the bi-lingual approach to education.... So no, I felt... I feel now that probably it was before its time, at least as it might relate to school children... for adults, perhaps somewhat less because it was possible to go and get classes of adults and at least teach some of them to read and write Navajo and they in turn could read the newspaper to people who couldn't themselves read.
- Q. Well, would you say that he was often times ahead of his times?
- A. I wouldn't be a bit surprised like many people... many thinkers in this category, I think even in many areas, he was well ahead of his time. I was just reading a little document on my desk, talking about the open classroom and reciting its relationship to progressive education and pointing out that it was not new, and of course this really rang a bell, because Beatty was a performant of progressive education in a period when progressive education was hardly accepted in the elite schools of the East, much less among teachers recruited to teach in reservation situations. So the net result was that progressive education in the hands of these completely untrained teachers was a little bit difficult to implement... They had all their training had been in these type of classroom situations and conduct that attached to education in 1920's.....
- Q. Well in this sense then... this is one of my major themes is his connection with the progressive education, you would say that he was ahead of the nation as a whole....
- A. He was right out in the lead, yes....
- Q. I mean dealing with progressive education through Indian education when actually as you say wasn't accepted?
- A. Well, it hadn't become characteristic of education throughout the country..... by any means at the time he was concerned with promoting it in Indian education

and of course the only opportunities for training or re-training of teachers was in the course of summer schools as they called them, that they held every year. Beatty used to expound the subjects and of course....

Q. On progressive education?

A. Yes, and on, well, on a great wide variety of subjects. He was quite... very excellent speaker and very excellent thinker and he was a man of enormous energy.... He just ran all over the country, he was always on the move and in summer school he was always lecturing, especially in the evening, they would have evening sessions and very well attended and so he was a person who had a great deal of information, he was a good thinker, he was an excellent speaker, in other words, he was really a leader and he was a person who could convince and could captivate his audience, but for them on the basis of this type of training, to overcome all the practices and customs that they had acquired in the course of previous experiences, is somewhat difficult. So many of them had no idea of how to operate a classroom within the framework imposed by the policies of principles of progressive education and then I am sure that the same thing is true today with the open classroom... If I had more time I would go visit some of them, I would just be real interested to see... how they operate, I would like to see test scores that would indicate the level of learning and that sort of thing because I am really skeptical, I don't really, I don't know, I am not skeptical about the principle involved, I am skeptical about the ability of the teachers to implement it.

Q. Oh.....

CONTINUATION OF INTERVIEW, PART II, THIS IS THE 1ST OF FEB. .

Q. Bob, we were talking last time about the bi-lingual books... program and I had read somewhere that there was also a bi-lingual film project.... Did you get in on any of that, do you know about it?

A. This is a long time ago, in say the early 1940's?

Q. Same period.... 1930's and 40's.....

----- INTERRUPTION

- Q. I had no part in any bi-lingual films that were made, but I have a vague recollection of some films that were made in Navajo and English... In Navajo only... probably by the delegation of health, under Dr. Peters at Fort Defiance... possibly in the late 1930's.... later, in the early 1950's some films were also made that I remember, one of them related to tuberculosis and I think the earlier one related to trachoma. The one that was made on tuberculosis was made in conjunction with an effort that was being made by the division of health of the then Bureau of Health Service... and the Navajo tribal council's health committee and it was related to the efforts that were being made under the leadership of Cornell University medical team and Annie Wauneka to educate Navajo people to the need for going to sanatoria and otherwise preventing themselves for treatment of active tuberculosis. Now then I am sure that there were other films too because I have seen them in the past, but I can't recite their names nor the subject matter, but I would suggest that you write to Haskell Institute in Lawrence, Kansas and ask for a list of Navajo language film that they might have in their depository there and you might also write to the materials center at Inter-Mountain School in Brigham City, Utah for the same list on the premise that it might be there, that's all I can give you on that.....
- Q. Fine... okay.... that's fine.... It is not a significant matter, but it is nice to be able to trace it down... going back to, let's see.... Let's see, to the war years a little bit. I have been reading about a project that the Indian bureau undertook with, first the University of Chicago on an inter-departmental committee and then with the Society for Applied Anthropology, are you, I trust you are familiar with what I am talking about, the contract which resulted in a number of books, People of the Middle Place, et cetera.....
- A. What are the names?
- Q. People of the Middle Place, Dorthea Latent was involved in this, John (?) programs.... all of the.... some of the big names in anthropology who went out in teams and researched and brought up the books and then the project was terminated in '47..... I wondered if you were at all connected with that?

- A. I went to some of the conferences that were held, it was an arrangement, a contractual arrangement as I remember, that was made by John Collier who was still Commissioner of Indian Affairs... and to which he brought some of the big names in anthropology and psychiatry, the Latents... Alexander and Dorothea Latent.... Clyde Kluckom... Professor Havinghurst from Chicago University, and a number of other people who's names I can't recall offhand.... I can't remember too much about the purpose of the contract except that it was designed, as I remember, to define the characteristics of a Navajo family to outline the conditions surrounding childhood training in Navajo and Hopi society.....
- Q. And Zuni and Sioux....
- A. Zuni and Sioux... yeah, that's right....
- Q. There were four that were involved... Warrior's Without Weapons was another.....
- A. McGregor... was one of the participants and wrote something on Sioux.... but I can't remember its name now...
- Q. That's the Warrior's Without Weapons....
- A. That's it....
- Q. I am throwing it out because I might....
- A. Navajo Door is probably the best...
- Q. That is right....
- A. Best summary about Latents... I think that is it... and then there is another book entitled The Navajo, by Clyde Kluckom that I remember was related to this project because he co-authored it with Dorothea Latent.
- Q. Yeah, that is right... that's right....
- A. But as I remember it had test material, there was test material developed and there was research carried out that related to the cultural framework that surrounded Indian people and specifically children.... and that imposed, perhaps conditions and constraints on the educational program serving them, I may be mistaken.....

- Q. No, I think you are very right and also the fact that in the 30's this idea of cross cultural education that we are talking about last time.... it is very difficult to approach it, is it not, if you are not aware of the elements of culture that you are working with.... and I think....
- A. Yes, it is my recollection that it was to meet these needs....
- Q. And well, if you weren't directly involved.....
- A. Laura Thompson was another individual.....
- Q. And she was the director... did you know her?
- A. I met her at that time, yes... She ended up marrying John Collier, you recall he divorced his wife and married Laura, sometime in the 1940's... I don't remember....
- Q. Well, that is a piece of information that I hadn't run into yet... that isn't covered in the official documents... and what have you, which stands to reason, that is most interesting...
- A. She was... as I remember Laura.... she was perhaps a professor of anthropology at maybe the University of Chicago. She specialized in somewhere on one of the Pacific Islands in the Phillipines or somewhere like that... and then had been called upon to take this job, and ended up marrying her boss, that is very interesting.... adds a nice juicy touch to the story....
- Q. Well, I would like to know.... We never really got very far in our discussion last time on chronological approach to what happened to you in the service and I am about to '43 and then there is a big gap and I wondered if you could carry on from there... for me....
- A. Well, let's see..... from the outset of the war... I think we covered that period, we had produced some teaching materials... to no small extent, the material designed for the teaching of reading and writing to Navajo children were translations of primers that had been developed by various individuals whose names I can't even remember, but you can get them off the cover of the books.... Vandel and Clark was one of them.... and these were, these were as I think I mentioned be-

fore, the best that could be done under the circumstances that were obtained in the early 1940's, a period during which there were very few native Navajo teachers... and so one had to draw on other resources for the production of children's literature.... There were not the trained native speakers of Navajo that could be drawn upon and although the books went some distance toward meeting the need, they obviously had a great many flaws in the sense that they were produced initially in English and translated into a language that is so different from English that it didn't really make too much sense to do it in this manner... and Handel and Clark somewhat poetic material, The Little Herder, was very beautifully done but this doesn't lend itself to easy translation into Navajo and so there were lots of areas that required a great deal of improvement, if one were to produce material that was really effective for the purpose for which you could design. Aside from those books as I think I mentioned, we launched the publication of the Navajo newspaper back sometime in that period, I don't remember now when the first issue came out, but it was very shortly after Pearl Harbor... It was right in the period around 1942 if I remember, we also produced other material aimed at adult, the book entitled (NAVAJO LANGUAGE), The Story of the Present War, and then there was an article I remember, fairly lengthy that related to education and attempted to encourage Navajo parents to put their children in school and make sure that they received an education.

Q. Was that the same time?

A. This is sometime in the period... it came out, it came out as I remember in connection with the conference that was held on the reservation, George Boyce was then the director of education and he called this conference and I recall that there were educators present as well as traders and other people from the reservation and its purpose was to discuss the problems that the war had imposed on continuation of the education program, the school programs on the reservation and this little document in that book came out of that period... relating to the same subject matter. Let's see, in about 1943, I was concerned with the Marine Corp in the recruitment of individual Navajos for possible service in a special communications unit utilizing the Navajo language and then in the early spring of 1944 I went into the Marine Corp stationed in Phoenix during most of the time that I served in that outfit and I continu-

ed there as the person responsible for selecting from Navajos that were drafted and/or volunteered for service. Those that were competent could be trained in this special communications school... and during the same period since normally I wasn't very busy except for about 10 days each month, there wasn't much to do around the induction stations and the Marine office down there. So I volunteered to assist in the psychology department and ended up running it, which was really one of the most interesting experiences in my life because it gave me something to do and I wasn't conditioned to sitting around playing cards and that sort of thing and it gave me something to do and since I had the opportunity to examine broad cross sections of people including all Indians from Arizona as well as other segments of the population, I learned a great deal. It was like going to school only being in a situation where I could conduct research, the type that would be very difficult if one weren't in the position that I was in... in military....

Q. Now was this at the University?

A. No, this is at the induction station, the armed force induction station in Phoenix... and through an arrangement between the Army, Navy and Marine Corp they all agreed to abide by my judgement in connection with the drafting of all people of other than Caucasian origin. So really what I did was pass on the eligibility for training of all Indians in Arizona as well as Spanish speaking people and even Negroes and Chinese and Japanese and everybody.... everybody that wasn't a Caucasian. So anyway I worked there for quite a period and then went out to San Diego where I wasn't concerned with this particular subject matter anymore, and got discharged and how to assert... it was rather an interesting experience as far as I was concerned....

Q. You were right in, closely connected with these fellows who were so changed by the war...?

A. Yes.

Q. And you saw them before they went in and did you also on some occasion see them when they came back?

A. Oh yeah.

Q. Any change in them?

- A. No, I didn't see any particular changes... well maybe the kind of change one gets by virtue of the fact that his horizons have been somewhat expanded by off reservation experiences, especially in the war theaters and that sort of thing... but obviously the people that I selected for service in the communications unit were quite highly acculturated individuals of which there was not too many at that particular period in history. They had to be very brilliant in English of course and they had to be very good in Navajo because the lives of many men might depend upon their understanding and accurately transmitting orders....
- Q. Well, were there not a number of.... no, that isn't true. Well, what I am going under the thesis that I am going under now from that question is that I have read many places that the Navajo were very effected by the war in one respect because so many of the young men that came back then said that your education was extremely important, is what I was getting at, is this, was this true according to the experience you had in your situation?
- A. Oh, I thought you mean that they had a traumatic experience, and as a result they came back with a psychiatric....
- Q. No, I didn't mean that.
- A. Yes, it is very true... Navajos in great numbers during the war years went off the reservation to work and for most of them it was the first time in their lives really that they had ever been very far... They had perhaps been to Gallup or Flagstaff or Holbrook or Winslow or Farmington but they had never lived and worked in areas remote from the reservation.... like Morenci, the mine. There were great numbers of Navajos who worked in the copper mines at Morenci... in fact there are still some there.... sort of a colony, I guess.
- Q. Well, for heaven's sake.....
- A. And they worked in copper mines up in Bingham Canyon in Utah, they worked in mines on the reservation as well, the palladium mines up around near Kayenta....
- Q. Were those the primary areas where they went?
- A. Those were some of the areas... many of them, of course,

went to the agricultural areas of southern Arizona and Idaho, Utah, Colorado, a great number of them went up to Reco, Colorado too and worked with the, in the Reco Argentine mines and there was quite a colony of Navajo up at Reco Argentine mine, even in the period immediately following the war, and most of them were recruited from areas close to Shiprock. They used to go up there and work all week and then many of them came down to their farms and so forth on the weekends.

Q. Then this wasn't... primarily wasn't urban work there?

A. Not necessarily... many of them went to California, some of them picked fruit, some of them worked in the ship yards and in other kinds of war time industries... Really what developed was a vacuum in menial types of work.... that is types of work that required little skill or training, the railroad I should have mentioned too. Great numbers went on the railroad... this vacuum developed and of course the various industries concerned began beating the bushes for employees and the Navajos being even then a very populous tribe had a good, a large labor pool from which they could regroup workers. So the Navajos moved into this vacuum in great numbers, of course they were thrown in contact with non-English speaking people...who couldn't speak Navajo and it became quite apparent to them that in order for their children to live happily and prosperously they were simply going to have to learn some of the things that people outside of the reservation did and certainly they were going to have to learn to speak English and understand it. Because this constituted a great problem for the Navajos living outside of the reservation they couldn't communicate with anyone except another Navajo and the industrial operators had to have interpreters to reach them... Well, the individual worker had a problem, it was very difficult for him to get that problem resolved, he couldn't go to the supervisor and outline his problem and get assistance because he couldn't speak to him. So there were many problems....

Q. This was not, the tremendous number of Indians that went into the Indian CCC in the 30's was really a drop in the bucket....

A. Yes and it was local too, and didn't impose the same range of problems that were imposed by off reservation living. Because here the people were working on the reservation, most of them were living still in their

own homes but some of them weren't those who were up in the forest cleaning up slash and that sort of thing. They would be camped out living in CCC camps but basically, it was still a local sort of development, it was not development of a type that put them in contact with other ethnic groups and....

- Q. What would you say was... this is not a very easy question to answer, but just off hand, would you say that most of those who went away for war work came back when the war was over?
- A. Yes, I would say that immediately after the cessation of hostilities a great number of people came back to the reservation because they didn't have anywhere else to go and in many instances, war time industries had ceased operation by that time... and they were out of a job or other people, other ethnic groups came back and they were also competitors in the labor market and this displaced lots of Navajos because some of them couldn't speak English yet. Obviously the employer being interested in his own profit was more inclined to hire people with whom he could communicate than people with whom he could not.... and lots of them came back to the reservation and there was really a critical period of readjustment right after the war from about 1946 to '47 down into the early 1950's and it was during this period of course, that the Red Cross was called upon and was very active in providing emergency food and clothing to Navajo people on the reservation, in which the Congress appropriated... made special appropriations of welfare funds to meet the emergency situations on the reservation because they had come back and in many instances their herds had been quite seriously depleted during the war years just did not keep them up. There simply were not the resources to support the population, there were no jobs on the reservation and this was also the period when the Bureau launched the employment assistance program and in which they set up field offices in certain locations. One was in Salt Lake City, one was in Dever, one was in Los Angeles... I think there was one in Chicago even in that early period... four or five of them. And each of them had a small Bureau staff and the person in charge along with them had the responsibility of finding jobs into which Navajo laborers could be moved... and then with the funds that were appropriated for this purpose they could be assisted in transporting their families or just transporting themselves to the point of employment and

this is what later turned into the relocation program but...

- Q. So this is sort of the transition then between the war and the termination decade so to speak?
- A. Yes, and it is the period during which Congress concerned itself with the Navajo-Hopi rehabilitation act... and you find the Crude report in 1948, I think it was when it finally printed and published. However it was the outgrowth of a number of conferences, both locally on the reservation and in Washington and a number of hearings that had been held by committees of Congress stretching from perhaps 1947 on down to the time the Crude Report came out.... and then of course, ultimately Truman signed it... in 1950 and the programs got underway and one aspect of course with relocation.
- Q. Do you think that... according to the reading that I have done, Williard Beatty, of course in the 30's was very much concerned with educating the Indian pupil, particularly those who went to the boarding schools in off reservation boarding schools for occupations which they could take up on the reservations before they finished schools, got agriculture training, cattle herding, this kind of thing. Then according to what I have read, when the war was over or during the last part of the war and in this period that you were just talking about, he really... he didn't make an about face, because I don't think that he was that kind of a person, but he really did alter his approach to encourage the young people to learn occupations which would take them off of the reservation, do you think I have this correct?
- A. Maybe in a sense.... when Willard Beatty first came in, the nation I think was in the last phases of a national depression and with a, with the economic situation as it obtained on the reservation during the depression years there was a greatly diminished market for local produce, sheep, wool, that sort of thing... Collier, you recall, came in in 1933 and with the intention of effectuating some of the recommendations of the Merriam Report, amongst them community development and education at a community level on the reservation rather than off reservation school operation because he felt and the Merriam Report felt that community involvement in education would go alot further in the direction of

solving emergent problems than would moving children to boarding schools in far distant locations. So the whole emphasis on education on the reservation in the last of the 1930's even was the development and the operation of community schools, community involvement and the use of various alphabetic organizations that came into existence during the depression years to put a new base under the reservation economy, one that was based on wage work and employment and to a greater extent than ever before, and then an emphasis on the reduction of dependence on livestock in view of the fact that it was held that the reservation couldn't support the livestock population necessary to in turn support all of the people.

Q. This was just on the Navajo reservation?

A. That is all that I am speaking of, but I am sure that all the factors obtained elsewhere for that matter and so yes, I would say that Beatty was primarily concerned with the use of education as a tool to accomplish these purposes within the reservation itself while as time passed and the depression passed, the war went by, capitalizing on the expanded experience of Navajo people. I think the emphasis on the education program then underwent change too to meet the new set of circumstances.... the circumstances weren't the same as they were during the depression years..... WPA, CCC and all of those organizations had passed from the scene and so one of the burdens of education became that of preparing the Navajo young people to make their living anywhere they might desire, whether on or off the reservation.... and of course, commensurate with opportunities for employment. Now even back in the 30's all education even in the boarding schools was not in the direction, exclusively, of preparing people to live on the reservation proper.

Q. No, I have mentioned that.

A. But a large part of it was... Phoenix for example, had a dairy herd, even within my own recollection, in the early 1940's and Navajo young people were taught about taking care of dairy cattle and milking them and of course, the products from the dairy were utilized in the feeding of the young people in the school, just as they had been in the creative years of the Merriam Report....

Q. Sure, sure....

- A. Was concerned with, but with a different set of circumstances, it wasn't as bad as it was then.....
- Q. Child labor.....
- A. Yeah, you didn't get the kind of child labor and you didn't get the type of so called vocational training that the Merriam Report pointed its finger at six or eight year old child might be assigned to milk cows for three or four years... as if it took that long to learn how to milk a cow....
- Q. Well, then Beatty actually was... this is the way that I have pictured... I was interested in your response, he was being realistic then because he was responding to the changing times...
- A. Yes, I think that Beatty was wholly realistic in his approach to Indian education.
- Q. Now wasn't it Hildegard Thompson's baby so to speak, the Navajo emergency education program?
- A. Yes, she and George.....
- Q. Oh yes... could you characterize her for me? I have talked to other people about her and I have corresponded with her.
- A. Well, Hildegard was and is... very energetic person....
- Q. She certainly is.
- A. She is a very competent person, I think, in the field of education during the period just after the war, it became evident that there was going to be very serious problems faced by Navajo young people... who had grown up with minimal opportunities for formal education and many who did not speak English... had no work skills and consequently could look forward only to menial jobs, as long as those menial jobs remained available and mechanization of sugar beet industry, railroad industry with new types of equipment that replaced many men, of course is sort of like handwriting on the wall... When we had to look at it, to read the fact that there were not going to be employment opportunities of these types, a few years hence... So in order to free Navajo young people of total dependence upon reservation resources that were inadequate... Hildegard and George

felt that it was urgently necessary to take this group of over aged Navajo children and at least give them enough English and enough knowledge of arithmetic basics that they could free themselves from the reservation, they could get a job doing something other than what a non-English speaking young person could get... with English they at least could go and get subsequent training in some fashion so that they could develop a favorable skill. So Hildegard.... and I really don't whose recommendation it was, that developed into the emergency education program but Hildegard was placed in charge of it. I rather suspect that Beatty and George both were among the prime movers in developing the principles, then Hilde moved in and she became the overall administrator and supervisor for the program and they found facilities in different locations whether it was in an off reservation boarding school put children in them, got teacher aides which spoke Navajo and English both and utilized them to accelerate education.... So it became a sort of five year program and incidentally there is a book in Navajo on that too....

Q. Oh, is that right?

A. Yeah, I just remember that...

Q. That is interesting, I read Ellis and Cooms book on that but I obviously haven't read the one in Navajo... but what kind.. is it very favorable, I trust?

A. Oh yeah... the book was to explain it and its purposes.

Q. Who wrote it?

A. My guess would be, trying to remember.. that probably Hilde did, Hildegard Thompson....

Q. She wrote it... in Navajo?

A. No... I'm sure it was translated from a manuscript and I think that Hildegard wrote it, I have it at home but I haven't seen it for so long, that just now talking about it, I even remember.....

Q. I thought you....

A. No...

Q. At the time....

- A. No, I don't remember when it was written either...
- Q. Well, Hildegard was characterized to me as being more or less hand.... no, that's not true.... trained and then hand picked by Beatty to be his successor? Did you hear that?
- A. No.
- Q. Yeah, but... do you know anything about the circumstances of the termination of his job when he left?
- A. Not in great detail, no... You know in the period after the war when Collier finally went out and I can't remember clearly exactly when that was... it could have been in '46....
- Q. No, he went out before Roosevelt died....
- A. When did....
- Q. It was January or February of '45....
- A. '45... well, anyway, by that time Collier had of course, become the central figure in a wide range of controversy as you probably know and Beatty was of course closely tied to the staff that Collier had brought into the Bureau of Indian Affairs... and of course with the conflict and the, the urgings for various types of changes that were being made by a wide range of individuals... who were already looking in the direction of termination and in the direction of solving Indian problems by the old method, of taking the children out of the reservation and training them to live in Cincinatti and that sort of thing... I think that Beatty finally just decided that it was just not going to be productive. That it was a situation which he didn't think he could continue to work, so he just withdrew.....
- Q. What would be your assessment of how Hildegard Thompson coped with this situation? Did she go along with the tide, or did she hold a restraining hand?
- A. Well, she wasn't in the first place in Washington at the time...
- Q. I meant when she was director?
- A. Of education?

Q. Yes.

A. Well, I tell you, before that she still hadn't been part of Washington staff... and you know when there is a change in administration the members of the Washington staff who came in with the previous commissioner and the previous set of policies are all suspect and there are efforts on the part of the new order to displace them and replace them with someone, I don't know just something that you would associate with the new order. So Hildegard wasn't in the first place immediately, directly associated, even though she was associated with Beatty and George Bush... and she did, I think, have some good ideas... She is a pleasant kind of person that has the ability to work with people and convince them first of things and she had a positive program, she is working towards special education, toward doing something... realistic to accomplish the purpose of educating Navajo children and all in all she just managed to survive... I don't know all the factors that were involved in her survival, but you would have to ask her, but she had alot of support and having alot of support, she was in a good position to stay in the saddle and with adaptations continue running the policies and principles that had been developed by Beatty in the previous years... even though there were quite sharp changes in directions from those policies....

Q. Well, would you say then that her coming at this period of time was a fortunate break for the Indians in that she provided a transition to the sixties that wasn't a sharp break?

A. Yes, I think it was and George Boyce of course, was director of education at Window Rock and with the launching of the Special Education program, George very easily moved into the rehabilitation of the Bushnell Hospital up in Brigham City..... it's organization and its launching is one of the bigger schools in the Special Education effort. George is a past master of the organization, so we were very fortunate in having someone of his particular talent available to accomplish this purpose and Hidle moved into then, into the vacuum he left and operated from the other end on the reservation and then of course she ultimately moved into the position of director of education in Washington. So it was a good rearrangement of talent I think. It was unfortunately perhaps, I think that Beatty left, be that as it may.... he did leave and these people operated very successfully I think.

Q. Would you say that things kind of fell apart when Mrs. Thompson left the service with no long term....?

A. Well, there were still people in there like Madison Cooms who are real intellectuals who had the.....

END OF TAPED INTERVIEW